

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105-3901

# <u>CERTIFIED MAIL</u> <u>RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED</u> <u>RECEIPT NO: 7010 2780 0000 8388 6705</u>

Date: SEP 2 4 2012

John Fry, CEO Fry's Electronics, Inc. 600 E. Brokaw Road San Jose, CA 95112

Re: <u>Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act</u> <u>Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing</u> Docket No.: FIFRA-09-2012-0006

Dear Mr. Fry:

Enclosed is a Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing concerning violations of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act ("FIFRA"). Specifically, the Complaint alleges that Fry's Electronics, Inc. violated Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA by selling or distributing an unregistered pesticide and Section 12(a)(2)(N) by failing to file reports (Notices of Arrival for pesticide imports) required by the Act.

You should be aware of the part of the Complaint entitled "Opportunity to Request a Hearing." You are required to respond to this Complaint within thirty (30) days of receipt of the Complaint. If you fail to file an Answer to this Complaint with the Regional Hearing Clerk within thirty (30) days of receipt, your failure shall constitute an admission of all facts alleged in the Complaint and a waiver of your right to a hearing. The proposed civil penalty shall become due and payable sixty (60) days after a final order is issued upon default.

Copies of the following rules and regulations are included for your information: (1) the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and (2) EPA's Enforcement Response Policy for the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, dated December 2009. If you have any questions, please contact (or have your attorney contact) Mr. Edgar Coral, Assistant Regional Counsel, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region IX, ORC-2, 75 Hawthorne Street, San Francisco, California 94105. Mr. Coral can be reached by telephone at (415) 972-3898.

Sincerely,

Katherine A. Taylor Associate Director for Agriculture Communities and Ecosystems Division

Enclosures

Cc: Patrick Thalken, California Department of Pesticide Regulation Alex Curotto, Esq.

\] & \] <i>2<sup>4</sup>\</i>	FILED	
Regional Counsel		
EDGAR P. CORAL	2012 SEP 24 AN 9: 52	
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency	U.S. EPA. REGION IX REGIONAL HEARING CLERK	
Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street		
San Francisco, CA 94105 (415) 972-3898		
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
ENVIRONMENTAL P	STATES ROTECTION AGENCY ON IX	
The the Master of	Destat No. 5122 4 00 2012 00 2 /	
	Docket No. FIFRA-09-2012-00_うし	
Fry's Electronics, Inc.,	COMPLAINT AND NOTICE OF	
) Dumun 1	OPPORTUNITY FOR HEARING	
Kespondent. )		
I. <u>AUTHORITY AND PARTIES</u>		
1. This is a civil administrative action br	ought pursuant to Section 14(a)(1) of the Federal	
Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act ("Fl	FRA"), 7 U.S.C. § $136l(a)(1)$ , for the assessment	
of a civil administrative penalty against Fry's El-	ectronics, Inc. ("Respondent") for (1) the sale	
and/or distribution of unregistered pesticides in	violation of Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA, 7	
U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A), and (2) the failure by a r	etailer or distributor to file reports required by	
FIFRA in violation of Section 12(a)(2)(N) of FII	FRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(N).	
2. Complainant is the Associate Directo	r for Agriculture of the Communities and	
Ecosystems Division in EPA, Region IX. The A	Administrator of EPA delegated to the Regional	
Administrator of Region IX the authority to brin	g this action under FIFRA by EPA Delegation	
Order Number 5-14, dated May 11, 1994. The H	Regional Administrator of Region IX further	
delegated the authority to bring this action under	FIFRA to the Associate Director for Agriculture	
	EDGAR P. CORAL Assistant Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105 (415) 972-3898 UNITED ENVIRONMENTAL P REGI In the Matter of: Fry's Electronics, Inc., Respondent.	

of the Communities and Ecosystems Division by EPA Regional Order Number 1255.08 CHG1,

dated June 9, 2005.

3. Respondent is Fry's Electronics, Inc., a corporation headquartered in San Jose, California.

## II. <u>GENERAL ALLEGATIONS</u>

4. Respondent is a corporation and therefore fits within the definition of "person" as that term is defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s). As such, Respondent is subject to FIFRA and the implementing regulations promulgated thereunder.

5. From July 2009 to February 2010, Respondent "distributed or sold" as those terms are defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), a product known as "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" to persons in the United States.

6. At all times relevant to this Complaint, the label for the product "Cambre Game OnDirt Rags Gaming Wipes" included the claims "Anti Bacterial" and "Anti Pathogen."

 "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" is a product intended to prevent, destroy, repel and/or mitigate bacteria and other microorganisms that are deleterious to man or the environment.

8. Bacteria and microorganisms that are deleterious to man or the environment are "pests" as that term is defined in Section 2(t) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(t) and 40 C.F.R. § 152.5(d).

9. A "pesticide" means "any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest." 7 U.S.C. § 136(u) and 40 C.F.R. § 152.3.

10. "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" is a "pesticide" as that term is defined in Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(u) and 40 C.F.R. § 152.3.

11. At all times relevant to this Complaint, the pesticide "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" was not registered under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a.

12. Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A), makes it unlawful for any person to distribute or sell to any person any pesticide that is not registered under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a.

Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing In re Fry's Electronics, Inc.

1

2

13. The importation of pesticides into the United States is governed by Sections 17(c)
and (e) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 1360(c) and 1360(e), and the regulations promulgated thereunder
by the Secretary of the Treasury in consultation with the Administrator of the EPA.

14. Section 17(c) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1360(c), requires the Secretary of the Treasury to notify the EPA Administrator of the arrival of pesticides and devices in the United States.

15. Section 17(e) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1360(e), requires the Secretary of the Treasury, in consultation with the Administrator, to prescribe regulations for the enforcement of Section 17(c) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1360(c).

9 16. Pursuant to Section 17(e) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1360(e), the Secretary of the
0 Treasury, acting through the United States Custom Service, prescribed regulations for the
1 enforcement of Section 17(c) of FIFRA at 19 C.F.R. §§ 12.110 - 12.117 (the "Pesticide Import
2 Regulations").

17. The Pesticide Import Regulations at 19 C.F.R. § 12.112(a) state, in pertinent part, that "an importer desiring to import pesticides or devices into the United States shall submit to the Administrator a Notice of Arrival of Pesticides and Devices (Environmental Protection Agency Form 3540-1), hereinafter referred to as a Notice of Arrival, prior to the arrival of the shipment in the United States."

18. Through the Notice of Arrival ("NOA"), the importer reports vital information to EPA regarding the pesticides or devices such as the major active ingredients, quantity, country of origin, producing establishment number, carrier, port of entry, and points of contact. This information allows EPA to make informed decisions, before pesticides and devices arrive in the United States, as to whether such importation will pose unreasonable adverse risks to public health and the environment. The NOA also provides contact information in the event of an emergency related to the movement of potentially toxic pesticide materials.

19. Pursuant to Section 12(a)(2)(N) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(N), "it shall be unlawful for any person who is a registrant, wholesaler, dealer, retailer, or other distributor to fail to file reports required by this Act."

Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing In re Fry's Electronics, Inc.

20. An NOA constitutes a report under Section 12(a)(2)(N) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(N), that must be filed with the EPA Administrator prior to the arrival of each shipment 3 of pesticides or devices in the United States.

### III. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

COUNTS 1-218: Sale and/or distribution of an unregistered pesticide, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A).

21. Paragraphs 4 through 20 above are hereby incorporated in these Counts 1-218 by reference as if the same were set forth herein in full.

22. From July 24, 2009 to February 6, 2010, Respondent "distributed or sold" as those terms are defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), the unregistered pesticide "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" to persons in the United States on 218 separate occasions.

23. By distributing or selling the unregistered pesticide "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" on 218 separate occasions from July 24, 2009 to February 6, 2010, Respondent committed 218 violations of Section 12(a)(1)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(A). COUNTS 219-224: Failure by a retailer or distributor to file reports required by FIFRA, 7

U.S.C. § 136i(a)(2)(N).

24. Paragraphs 4 through 20 above are hereby incorporated in these Counts 219-224 by reference as if the same were set forth herein in full.

25. On July 17, July 20, July 21, July 22, July 23, and July 27, 2009, Respondent received six shipments of the pesticide "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes."

26. These six shipments of the pesticide "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" 22 were imported into the United States by Respondent directly from the manufacturer, Cambre 23 Products, a Canadian company headquartered in Ontario, Canada.

24 27. Respondent failed to submit NOAs to EPA prior to the arrival of each of the six shipments of the pesticide "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" received on July 17, 2526 July 20, July 21, July 22, July 23, and July 27, 2009.

27 28. Respondent's failure to submit NOAs to EPA prior to the arrival of these six shipments of the pesticide "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" constitutes six separate 28

1

2

4

5

6

failures to file reports required pursuant to Section 17(c) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1360(c), and 19 C.F.R. § 12.112(a).

29. By failing to file reports required by FIFRA on six separate occasions prior to the arrival of imported shipments of the pesticide "Cambre Game On Dirt Rags Gaming Wipes" on July 17, July 20, July 21, July 22, July 23, and July 27, 2009, Respondent committed six violations of Section 12(a)(1)(N) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(N).

7

8

11

14

1

2

3

4

5

6

#### IV. PROPOSED CIVIL PENALTY

Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1361(a)(1), and the Civil Monetary Penalty 9 Inflation Adjustment Rule, 40 C.F.R. Part 19, authorize the assessment of a civil administrative 10penalty of up to \$7,500 for each violation of FIFRA occurring after January 12, 2009. For purposes of determining the amount of the civil penalty to be assessed, FIFRA Section 14(a)(4) 12 requires EPA to consider the size of Respondent's business, the effect on Respondent's ability to 13 continue in business and the gravity of the violations alleged. Accordingly, Complainant requests that after consideration of these statutory assessment factors, the Administrator assess Respondent a civil administrative penalty of up to \$7,500 for each of the 224 violations of 15 FIFRA set forth above. 16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

## V. NOTICE OF OPPORTUNITY TO REQUEST A HEARING

You have the right to request a formal hearing to contest any material fact set forth in this Complaint or to contest the appropriateness of the proposed penalty. Any hearing requested will be conducted in accordance with the Administrative Procedure Act, 5 U.S.C. § 551 et seq., and the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation or Suspension of Permits (the "Consolidated Rules of Practice"), 40 C.F.R. Part 22. A copy of the Consolidated Rules of Practice is enclosed with this Complaint.

24 You must file a written Answer within thirty (30) days of receiving this Complaint to 25 avoid being found in default, which constitutes an admission of all facts alleged in the 26 Complaint and a waiver of the right to a hearing, and to avoid having the above penalty 27 assessed without further proceedings. If you choose to file an Answer, you are required by the 28 Consolidated Rules of Practice to clearly and directly admit, deny, or explain each of the factual

1	allegations contained in this Complaint to which one have and 1 and 1 and 1
	allegations contained in this Complaint to which you have any knowledge. If you have no
2	knowledge of a particular fact and so state, the allegation is considered denied. Failure to deny
3	any of the allegations in this Complaint will constitute an admission of the undenied allegation.
4	The Answer shall also state the circumstances and arguments, if any, which are alleged to
<sup>.</sup> 5	constitute the grounds of defense, and shall specifically request an administrative hearing, if
6	desired. If you deny any material fact or raise any affirmative defense, you will be considered to
7	have requested a hearing. The Answer must be filed with:
8	Regional Hearing Clerk (ORC-1).
9	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105
10	
11	In addition, please send a copy of the Answer and all other documents that you file in this action
12	to:
13	Edgar P. Coral Office of Regional Counsel (ORC-2)
14	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street
15	San Francisco, CA 94105
16	You are further informed that the Consolidated Rules of Practice prohibit any <i>ex parte</i>
17	(unilateral) discussion of the merits of any action with the Regional Administrator, Regional
18	Judicial Officer, Administrative Law Judge, or any person likely to advise these officials in the
	decision of the case, after the Complaint is issued.
19	VI. INFORMAL SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE
20	EPA encourages all parties against whom a civil penalty is proposed to pursue the
21	possibility of settlement through informal conferences. Therefore, whether or not you request a
22	hearing, you may confer informally with EPA through Mr. Coral, the EPA attorney assigned to
23	this case, regarding the facts of this case, the amount of the proposed penalty, and the possibility
24	of settlement. An informal settlement conference does not, however, affect your obligation
25	to file an Answer to this Complaint.
26	VII. ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION
27	The parties also may engage in any process within the scope of the Alternative Dispute
28	Resolution Act, 5 U.S.C. § 581 et seq., which may facilitate voluntary settlement efforts.
	Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing Page 6 In re Fry's Electronics, Inc.

. . . .

Dispute resolution using alternative means of dispute resolution does not divest the Presiding Officer of jurisdiction nor does it automatically stay the proceeding.

# VIII. CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

EPA has the authority, where appropriate, to modify the amount of the proposed penalty to reflect any settlement reached with you in an informal conference or through alternative dispute resolution. The terms of such an agreement would be embodied in a Consent Agreement and Final Order. A Consent Agreement signed by both parties would be binding as to all terms and conditions specified therein when the Regional Judicial Officer signs the Final Order.

Dated at San Francisco, California on this  $20^{\circ}$  day of September, 2012.

1

2

З

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

ERINE A. T XLOR

Associate Director for Agriculture Communities and Ecosystems Division U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, California 94105

• • •	
1	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
2	I certify that the original and one copy of the foregoing Complaint and Notice of
3	Opportunity for Hearing (Docket No. FIFRA-09-2012-00 06) was hand delivered to:
4	
5	Regional Hearing Clerk
6	Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street
7	San Francisco, California 94105
8	and that a true and correct copy of the Complaint; the Consolidated Rules of Practice, 40 C.F.R.
9	Part 22; and the FIFRA Enforcement Response Policy were placed in the United States Mail, certified mail, return receipt requested, addressed to the following:
10	
11	John Fry CEO
12	Fry's Electronics, Inc. 600 E. Brokaw Road
13	San Jose, CA 95112
14	
15	
16	9/24/12 15 the
17	Dated:By:U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for HearingPage 8In re Fry's Electronics, Inc.